

Calgary (Alberta), Canada **HEADQUARTERS** 

- **MAIN** RBC Global Asset Management, Inc. 4.53%
- **SHAREHOLDERS**  $^1$  1832 Asset Management LP 3.28%
  - The Vanguard Group, Inc. 2.35%
  - RBC Dominion Securities, Inc. 2.35%
  - TD Asset Management, Inc. 1.82%
  - BMO Asset Management, Inc. 1.51%
  - BMO Asset Management Corp. 1.30%
  - RREEF America LLC 1.28%
  - CIBC World Markets, Inc. 1.10%
  - Mackenzie Financial Corp. 0.94%

- **PROFITS** US\$1.99 billion in 2022
  - US\$17.98 billion between 2016 and 2022

# **TOP SALARIES AND BONUSES**

US\$17.23 million for CEO Al Monaco (2022)2

# **AND SHARE BUYBACKS**

- **DIVIDEND PAY-OUTS** US\$5.41 billion in dividend payouts in 2022; US\$27.95 billion between 2016 and 2022
  - \$0.11 billion in share buybacks in 2022; \$2.83 billion between 2016 and 2022

# RENEWABLE **GENERATION**

2.17 GW capacity as of 2023 3

	2022	2021	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016
NET PROFIT (CA\$ BILLION)	2.59	5.82	2.98	5.32	2.52	2.53	1.78
NET PROFIT (US\$ BILLION)	1.99	4.65	2.24	3.99	1.94	1.87	1.30
DIVIDENDS (CA\$ BILLION)	7.02	6.82	6.61	5.97	4.66	3.56	1.95
DIVIDENDS (US\$ BILLION)	5.41	5.45	4.96	4.48	3.59	2.64	1.42
SHARE BUYBACKS (CA\$ BILLION) 4	No data						
SHARE BUYBACKS (US\$ BILLION)	- 0.11	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.02	1.20	1.71

<sup>\*</sup> Exchange rate based on IRS annual values: https://www.irs.gov/individuals/international-taxpayers/ yearly-average-currency-exchange-rates

Enbridge was originally named the Interprovincial Pipe Line Company when it was founded in 1949.5 The firm was established to transport oil and gas between Canadian provinces and to the United States for the Imperial Oil company.6 It changed its name to Enbridge in 1998.7 Enbridge operates the world's longest crude oil and liquids pipeline system, with 28,661 kilometres of crude oil pipelines and 123,189 kilometres of natural gas pipelines in North America.8 Approximately 95 per cent of its income is generated from fossil fuels.9

In recent years, however, company executives have stated that they have an interest in investing in renewable energy, especially European wind farms, because of the attractive financial incentives on offer. 10 Enbridge claims that it wants to achieve zero carbon by 2050.11 It has taken minority stakes in the 447 megawatt Rampion offshore wind farm off the coast of England and the 639.45 megawatt Hohe See and Albatros wind projects off the coast of Germany, as well as a number of onshore wind farms in Texas. 12 In France, Enbridge has minority stakes in the 498 megawatt Fécamp offshore wind farm, the 480 megawatt Saint-Nazaire offshore wind farm, and the 450 megawatt Calvados offshore wind farm. 13 The company has also bought the Sarnia Photovoltaic Power Plant in Ontario and expanded it to 97 megawatts, after the provincial government offered a CA\$0.44 (US\$0.34 at the time) price guarantee,14 one of the highest in the world.15

Meanwhile, the company has attracted a lot of opposition to its major pipelines, in particular to the proposed replacement and and maintenance of Line 3, which runs from Edmonton in Alberta, Canada, to the Superior Terminal in Wisconsin in the US. This work will increase the capacity of the line, which currently transports 390,000 barrels of tar sands crude oil a day.16 Opposition is also raised to the poor safety management of Line 5 which runs from the Superior Terminal to Sarnia, Ontario, through the Great Lakes, transporting 540,000

barrels of tar sands crude oil a day.<sup>17</sup> Other controversial pipelines include Line 6B (from Griffith, Indiana, to Sarnia) and Line 9 (from Sarnia to Montreal, Quebec) as well as the Dakota Access Pipeline (from the Bakken Formation in North Dakota to an oil terminal near Patoka, Illinois) in which Enbridge has a 27.6 per cent stake.18

Critics point to the numerous oil spills from the company's pipelines that have taken place over the years. Greenpeace analysed data from the US Pipeline and Hazardous Materials Safety Administration to show that pipelines owned by Enbridge and its joint ventures and subsidiaries suffered 307 hazardous liquids incidents between 2002 and 2018 — approximately one spill every 20 days on average. 19 Two of the biggest spills included 40,000 barrels of oil that spilled from Line 3 in 1991 in Grand Rapids, Minnesota, and a 20,000 barrel tar sands spill from Line 6B into the Kalamazoo River in Michigan in 2010.20

Line 3 involves building new pipelines through Indigenous territories in Minnesota. Whilst Enbridge assured us in their feedback that they consulted Indigenous representatives throughout the process, our own research has shown that Line 3 has also been fiercely opposed by many local tribes.<sup>21</sup> In 2021, a consortium of Canada's biggest banks gave Enbridge a CA\$1.5 billion loan to complete Line 3, in part conditional on the company meeting 'sustainability' criteria such as reducing greenhouse gas emission intensity by 35 per cent by 2030.22 'Giving Enbridge a sustainability loan is like giving a weapons manufacturer a "peace" loan; it's like giving a cigarette company a "health" loan,' says Tara Houska, the founder of Giniw Collective and a member of the Couchiching First Nation Anishinaabe peoples. 'Even if Enbridge does plan on building a few solar panels with that money, you can't put a fire out and pour millions of barrels of tar sands on it at the same time'. 23

Dozens of protests have taken place against the company in Canada and the US, including numerous efforts to shut down the pipeline via blockades, civil disobedience and lockdowns. A series of articles for the Intercept, as well as the Brennan Law Centre, suggest the company has allegedly fought back by hiring surveillance companies and even coordinating with local police operations against the activists in Minnesota.<sup>24</sup> Enbridge confirmed that whilst they did not directly fund local police operations, they did so indirectly, through their funding of an independent account manager (as part of the Public Utilities Commission requirement to fund a Public Safety Escrow Account) who made financial decisions and allocated funds to local police enforcement.<sup>25</sup>

Meanwhile, Line 5, almost 70 years old, runs through the Straits of Mackinac, which connect Lake Michigan to Lake Huron.<sup>26</sup> A 2016 report to the US Congress showed that the pipeline was missing bottom anchors that should hold it in place in 16 major locations, including one place in which an 87 metre length of the 76 centimetre wide pipeline was unsecured.<sup>27</sup> Engineering experts say that Line 5 is 'one peak current event' away from failure that could contaminate over 1,100 kilometres of the shoreline of the Great Lakes.<sup>28</sup>

In an effort to bolster public support for Line 5, Enbridge ran an advertisement in 2019 that showed Eric Anderson, an oceanographer with the government's National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA)'s Great Lakes Environmental Research Laboratory, under a headline reading: 'We're working to protect Michigan's water'.<sup>29</sup> In fact neither Anderson nor the NOAA had given Enbridge permission to use Anderson's image in their advertising. The company was forced to apologise and withdraw the ad.<sup>30</sup>

Gretchen Whitmer, the governor of the state of Michigan, ordered the company to cease operations by May 2021 following a state review that found the Line 5 petroleum pipeline is putting the Great Lakes at risk.31 The company has refused to do this and the matter is now being fought in the courts.<sup>32</sup> The lawsuit aiming to remove Line 5 is being supported by a coalition of more than 60 Tribal Nations.33 Meanwhile, activists have also been fighting Enbridge by filing shareholder resolutions against the company's financial backers such as the Royal Bank of Canada.34 Unfortunately for the activists, the new Inflation Reduction Act that the US Congress passed in 2022 provides expedited permitting for natural gas pipelines, which may help Enbridge get its way.35

## CORE CONTROVERSIES

- Enbridge operates the longest crude oil and liquids pipeline system in the world.
- In recent years, Enbridge has started to invest in renewable energy due to the attractive financial incentives on offer.
- The opposed replacement of its Line 3 will involves building through Indigenous territories.
- There has been approximately one spill from Enbridge's pipelines every 20 days between 2002-2018.
- Its Line 5 has been shown to be missing critical anchors to hold it in place, posing the possibility of huge environmental catastrophe.
- In 2021, Enbridge received a CA\$1.1 billion loan from Canada's biggest banks to complete Line 3. This loan was in part conditional on the company meeting 'sustainability' criteria.
- The company is currently in the courts for failing to cease all operations on its Line 5 pipeline when ordered to do so by the Michigan governor.

This report was shared with Enbridge before publication. Some adjustments were made following their response.

### **ENDNOTES**

- Please note, this data changes regularly. Source: CNN Business (n.d.) 'Enbridge Inc'. https://money.cnn.com/quote/shareholders/shareholders.html?symb=ENB&subView=institutional Last accessed: 24 October 2023
- 2. N.B. Greg Ebel took over as CEO in 2023. Source: Milstead, D. (2023) 'Imperial Oil CEO best-paid in Canadian energy industry at \$17.3 million', 20 April. https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/article-imperial-oil-ceo-best-paid-in-canadian-energy-industry-at-173-million/ Last accessed: 31 October 2023
- Enbridge (n.d.) 'Fact sheets and brochures (renewables operations)'. https://www.enbridge.com/media-center/fact-sheets-brochuresrenewables Last accessed 31 October 2023; Enbridge (2023) Tomorrow is on', June, p. 4. https://www.enbridge.com/~/media/Enb/ Documents/Factsheets/FS\_WhoWeAre\_LifeTakesEnergy.pdf Last accessed 31 October 2023; This figure is the net capacity that is in operation and under construction. Net refers to the amount of gross electricity generation a generator produces minus the electricity used to operate the power plant. For more information, check: https://www.eia.gov/tools/faqs/faq.php?id=101&t=3
- 4. Share buyback data only sourced in US\$.
- 5. Enbridge. (n.d.) 'Our History'. https://www.enbridge.com/about-us/our-history Last accessed: 10 October 2023
- 7. Ibid.
- 8. Enbridge. (n.d.) 'Liquids Pipelines'. https://www.enbridge.com/About-Us/Liquids-Pipelines Last accessed: 26 September 2023; and Enbridge. (n.d.) 'Fact sheets and brochures (natural gas operations)'. https://www.enbridge.com/media-center/fact-sheets-brochures-gtm Last accessed: 26 September 2023
- 9. Morgan, G. (2020) 'North America's largest pipeline company aims to pivot to natural gas and renewable energy', 8 June. https://financialpost.com/commodities/energy/north-americas-largest-pipeline-company-aims-to-pivot-to-natural-gas-and-renewableenergy Last accessed: 10 October 2023
- 10. Enbridge. (n.d.) 'Advancing Renewable Energy'. https://www.enbridge.com/~/media/Enb/Documents/Brochures/US/Brochure\_ Renewable\_Energy\_US\_audience.pdf pg. 6. Last accessed: 3 October 2023
- 11. Morgan, G. (2020) 'North America's largest pipeline company aims to pivot to natural gas and renewable energy', 8 June. https://financialpost.com/commodities/energy/north-americas-largest-pipeline-company-aims-to-pivot-to-natural-gas-and-renewableenergy Last accessed: 6 October 2023
- 12. Enbridge. 'Renewable energy'. https://www.enbridge.com/About-Us/Renewable-energy Last accessed 1 November 2022
- 13.
- 14. Hamilton, T. (2011) 'Ontario Struggles with Solar Boom', 9 March. https://www.technologyreview.com/2011/03/09/196484/ontario-struggleswith-solar-boom/ Last accessed: 10 October 2023
- Enbridge. (n.d.) 'Renewable energy', https://www.enbridge.com/About-Us/Renewable-energy Last accessed 1 November 2022
- Williams, N. (2021) 'Enbridge's long-delayed Line 3 oil piperline project to start up Oct. 1', 29 September. https://www.reuters.com/business/energy/enbridge-completes-line-3-oil-pipeline-replacement-project-starts-linefill-2021-09-29/ Last accessed: 10 October 2023; and Kusnetz, N. (2017) 'Tar Sands Pipeline that Could Rival Keystone XL Quietly Gets Trump Approval', 20 October. https://insideclimatenews.org/news/20102017/tar-sands-oil-pipeline-approved-line-67-alberta-clipper-enbridge-keystone/ Last accessed: 10 October 2023
- 17. Williams, N. and Malo, S. (2021) 'Canada invokes 1977 pipeline treaty with U.S. over line 5 dispute', 4 October. https://www.reuters.com/ business/energy/canada-formally-invokes-1977-pipeline-treaty-with-us-over-line-5-dispute-2021-10-04/ Last accessed: 10 October 2023
- 18. Enbridge. (n.d.) 'Liquid Pipelines'. https://www.enbridge.com/About-Us/Liquids-Pipelines Last accessed 1 November 2022; and Enbridge. 'Natural Gas Transmission and Midstream'. https://www.enbridge.com/About-Us/Natural-Gas-Transmission-and-Midstream Last Accessed 1 November 2022
- Greenpeace. (2018) 'Dangerous Pipelines: Enbridge's History of Spills Threatens Minnesota Waters', 14 November. https://www.greenpeace.org/usa/reports/dangerous-pipelines/ Last accessed: 28 September 2023
- 20. Ibid.
- 21. Ibid.
- Woodside, J. (2021) 'Canadian banks are loaning Enbridge over \$1B with questionable sustainability requirements', 27 September. https://www.thestar.com/news/canada/2021/09/27/canadian-banks-are-loaning-enbridge-over-1b-with-questionable-sustainabilityrequirements.html Last accessed: 28 September 2023

- Houska, T. (2021) 'Enbridge's Greenwashing Will Not Stand', 8 March. 23. https://stopthemoneypipeline.com/enbridges-greenwashing-will-not-stand/ Last accessed 14 October 2023
- Mueller-Hsia, K. (2021) 'How an Oil Company Pays Police to Target Pipeline Protesters', 7 October. 24. https://www.brennancenter.org/our-work/analysis-opinion/how-oil-company-pays-police-target-pipeline-protesters Last accessed: 28 September 2023; and Brown, A. (2017) 'Policing the Pipeline', 12 August. https://theintercept.com/series/policing-thepipeline/ Last accessed: 28 September 2023
- Email from Enbridge's Communications and Media Relations team. 25.
- 26. Enbridge. (n.d.) 'About Line 5'. https://www.enbridge.com/projects-and-infrastructure/public-awareness/line-5-michigan/about-line-5 Last
- Campbell, B. (2017) 'A cheat sheet to the Enbridge Line 5 controversy', 27 June. 27. https://www.bridgemi.com/michigan-government/cheat-sheet-enbridge-line-5-controversy Last accessed: 10 October 2023
- 28.
- Mauger, C. and Malewitz, J. (2019) 'How a U.S. scientist unknowingly starred in an Enbridge Michigan ad campaign', 30 September. 29. https://www.bridgemi.com/michigan-environment-watch/how-us-scientist-unknowingly-starred-enbridge-michigan-ad-campaign Last accessed 14 October 2023
- Mauger, C. (2019) 'Enbridge halts Line 5 Michigan ads featuring U.S. scientist, apologizes', 30 September. https://www.bridgemi.com/ 30. michigan-environment-watch/enbridge-halts-line-5-michigan-ads-featuring-us-scientist-apologizes Last accessed 14 October 2023
- House, K. and Oosting, J. (2020) 'Whitmer orders Enbridge Line 5 shutdown, citing easement violations', 13 November. 31. https://www.bridgemi.com/michigan-environment-watch/whitmer-orders-enbridge-line-5-shutdown-citing-easement-violations Last accessed 14 October 2023
- House, K. (2021) 'Michigan drops one lawsuit, revisits another in Enbridge Line 5 fight', 30 November. 32. https://www.bridgemi.com/michigan-environment-watch/michigan-drops-one-lawsuit-revisits-another-enbridge-line-5-fight Last accessed: 14 October 2023; and Williams, N. (2022). 'Judge rules oil pipeline dispute between Enbridge and Michigan belongs in federal court', 18 August. https://www.reuters.com/legal/judge-rules-michigans-line-5-oil-pipeline-lawsuit-should-be-heard-federalcourt-2022-08-18/ Last accessed: 14 October 2023; Interlochen Public Radio (2023) 'AG Nessel, Michigan tribes, voice support for Bad River Band appeal of Line 5 ruling, 23 October. https://www.interlochenpublicradio.org/2023-10-23/ag-nessel-michigan-tribes-voicesupport-for-bad-river-band-appeal-of-line-5-ruling Last accessed: 28 October 2023
- Native America Rights Fund. (2023) 'Over 60 Tribal Nations Side with AG Nessel in Line 5 Lawsuit', 25 September. 33. https://narf.org/bay-mills-line5-pipeline/ Last accessed: 14 October 2023
- Price, M. (2022) Why We Filed a Shareholder Resolution with RBC on Greenwashing and Sustainable Finance', 17 February. 34. https://www.investorsforparis.com/why-we-filed-a-shareholder-resolution-with-rbc-on-greenwashing-and-sustainable-finance/ Last accessed: 14 October 2023
- Western Environmental Law Center. (2022) 'STATEMENT: Inflation Reduction Act-related "permitting reforms" threaten 35. bedrock environmental laws', 2 August. https://westernlaw.org/statement-inflation-reduction-act-permitting-reforms-threaten-bedrockenvironmental-laws/ Last accessed: 14 October 2023

For over a century, energy multinationals have been wrecking the planet and exploiting people in pursuit of profit. Now, power producers and technology manufacturers are marketing themselves as 'green' to boost their reputation and benefit from public subsidies, grabbing lands, violating human rights and destroying communities along the way. Our investigation of fifteen 'green' multinationals conclusively shows that financial returns, not decarbonisation, is their primary business. 'Green' capital has taken over the energy transition, dictating its pace and blocking climate policies that hamper its profits. It is time to take on these greenwashing corporations and reclaim the entire energy sector through public ownership and democratic governance.

Download the full report and the 14 other company profiles on https://www.tni.org/GreenMultinationals.

